



Survey Instrument, Productivity Charts, and Interview Protocol for Case Studies for TCRP Report 142

DETAILS

0 pages | null | PAPERBACK

ISBN 978-0-309-43014-2 | DOI 10.17226/22934

AUTHORS

BUY THIS BOOK

FIND RELATED TITLES

Visit the National Academies Press at NAP.edu and login or register to get:

- Access to free PDF downloads of thousands of scientific reports
- 10% off the price of print titles
- Email or social media notifications of new titles related to your interests
- Special offers and discounts



Distribution, posting, or copying of this PDF is strictly prohibited without written permission of the National Academies Press. (Request Permission) Unless otherwise indicated, all materials in this PDF are copyrighted by the National Academy of Sciences.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This work was sponsored by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) in cooperation with the Transit Development Corporation. It was conducted through the Transit Cooperative Research Program (TCRP), which is administered by the Transportation Research Board (TRB) of the National Academies.

COPYRIGHT INFORMATION

Authors herein are responsible for the authenticity of their materials and for obtaining written permissions from publishers or persons who own the copyright to any previously published or copyrighted material used herein.

Cooperative Research Programs (CRP) grants permission to reproduce material in this publication for classroom and not-for-profit purposes. Permission is given with the understanding that none of the material will be used to imply TRB, AASHTO, FAA, FHWA, FMCSA, FTA, Transit Development Corporation, or AOC endorsement of a particular product, method, or practice. It is expected that those reproducing the material in this document for educational and not-for-profit uses will give appropriate acknowledgment of the source of any reprinted or reproduced material. For other uses of the material, request permission from CRP.

DISCLAIMER

The opinions and conclusions expressed or implied in this report are those of the researchers who performed the research. They are not necessarily those of the Transportation Research Board, the National Research Council, or the program sponsors.

The information contained in this document was taken directly from the submission of the author(s). This material has not been edited by TRB.

THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES

Advisers to the Nation on Science, Engineering, and Medicine

The **National Academy of Sciences** is a private, nonprofit, self-perpetuating society of distinguished scholars engaged in scientific and engineering research, dedicated to the furtherance of science and technology and to their use for the general welfare. On the authority of the charter granted to it by the Congress in 1863, the Academy has a mandate that requires it to advise the federal government on scientific and technical matters. Dr. Ralph J. Cicerone is president of the National Academy of Sciences.

The **National Academy of Engineering** was established in 1964, under the charter of the National Academy of Sciences, as a parallel organization of outstanding engineers. It is autonomous in its administration and in the selection of its members, sharing with the National Academy of Sciences the responsibility for advising the federal government. The National Academy of Engineering also sponsors engineering programs aimed at meeting national needs, encourages education and research, and recognizes the superior achievements of engineers. Dr. Charles M. Vest is president of the National Academy of Engineering.

The **Institute of Medicine** was established in 1970 by the National Academy of Sciences to secure the services of eminent members of appropriate professions in the examination of policy matters pertaining to the health of the public. The Institute acts under the responsibility given to the National Academy of Sciences by its congressional charter to be an adviser to the federal government and, on its own initiative, to identify issues of medical care, research, and education. Dr. Harvey V. Fineberg is president of the Institute of Medicine.

The **National Research Council** was organized by the National Academy of Sciences in 1916 to associate the broad community of science and technology with the Academy's purposes of furthering knowledge and advising the federal government. Functioning in accordance with general policies determined by the Academy, the Council has become the principal operating agency of both the National Academy of Sciences and the National Academy of Engineering in providing services to the government, the public, and the scientific and engineering communities. The Council is administered jointly by both the Academies and the Institute of Medicine. Dr. Ralph J. Cicerone and Dr. Charles M. Vest are chair and vice chair, respectively, of the National Research Council.

The **Transportation Research Board** is one of six major divisions of the National Research Council. The mission of the Transportation Research Board is to provide leadership in transportation innovation and progress through research and information exchange, conducted within a setting that is objective, interdisciplinary, and multimodal. The Board's varied activities annually engage about 7,000 engineers, scientists, and other transportation researchers and practitioners from the public and private sectors and academia, all of whom contribute their expertise in the public interest. The program is supported by state transportation departments, federal agencies including the component administrations of the U.S. Department of Transportation, and other organizations and individuals interested in the development of transportation. www.TRB.org

www.national-academies.org

CONTENTS

Appendix A: Copy of National Survey Instrument.....	A-1
Appendix B: Productivity by Tenure Group, DART, Dallas, TX.....	B-1
Appendix C: Productivity by Tenure Group, LYNX, Orlando, FL	C-1
Appendix D: Interview Protocol for Case Studies on Workforce Integration and Wage Parity.....	D-1

APPENDIX A

Copy of National Survey Instrument

Note: In several places, notes have been added indicating that if certain responses were given the survey skipped to a specific question. This text (e.g., “Skip to Question XX”) was not in the actual survey. Since the survey was electronic, answering questions a certain way resulted in the respondent being automatically taken to the next appropriate question. The “Skip to...” text has been added to this paper copy to give the reader an idea of the actual flow of the survey.

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

Introduction

This survey is being conducted as part of a national research project sponsored by the Transit Cooperative Research Program (TCRP), which is part of the National Academy of Sciences. The purpose of the research is to examine the factors that affect the recruitment and retention of vehicle operators used in the provision of ADA complimentary paratransit services. Best practices and guidance on improving recruitment and retention will be developed.

The survey is designed to gather information about ADA complementary paratransit vehicle operator recruitment and retention from public transit agencies that operate these services directly, as well as from private entities that provide ADA complementary paratransit service under contract to public transit agencies. **IF YOU ARE A PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCY THAT CONTRACTS FOR SOME OR ALL OF YOUR ADA COMPLEMENTARY PARATRANSIT SERVICE, PLEASE COMPLETE THE SURVEY AND ALSO FORWARD THE SURVEY LINK TO YOUR CONTRACTED SERVICE PROVIDERS THAT HIRE VEHICLE OPERATORS AND PROVIDE SERVICES DIRECTLY.** The survey has a separate "contractor" section that requests vehicle operator recruitment and retention information from private contractors. If you utilize a contracted "broker" to manage ADA paratransit services, it is also important that the broker forward the survey link to any subcontractors who operate ADA paratransit services under their direction.

HELPFUL HINT: The survey asks PUBLIC ENTITIES to provide service statistics for the most recent fiscal year (ridership, miles, hours, costs). You may want to gather this information before proceeding.

Use the tab key or your mouse to move between entry boxes; do not use the arrow keys.

Survey responses will not be saved until the NEXT link on a page or the DONE link on the last page has been clicked. If you work from the same computer terminal, you may use the survey link provided in your email to go back and edit your response at any time, prior to completion of the survey. Once you have clicked on the DONE button, you will not be able to edit your response.

This research is being conducted by the TranSystems Corporation. For technical questions, or assistance in completing this survey, please contact Caroline Ferris of TranSystems at crferris@transystems.com.

Thank you for your assistance in providing information about this important issue.

Contact Information

Please provide contact information

Full Business Name of Agency or Company:	<input type="text"/>
System/ Company Abbreviation or Acronym, if Applicable:	<input type="text"/>
Address:	<input type="text"/>
City:	<input type="text"/>
State:	<input type="text"/>
Zip Code:	<input type="text"/>
Person Completing Survey:	<input type="text"/>
Title:	<input type="text"/>
Phone:	<input type="text"/>
Fax:	<input type="text"/>
E-mail Address:	<input type="text"/>

Agency Type

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

1. Are you a public transit agency or a private company providing ADA paratransit services under contract?

A public transit agency

A private company providing ADA paratransit services under contract **Skip to question 8**

Impact of Recruitment and Retention

In your opinion, which of the following statements best describes the impact that vehicle operator recruitment and retention has had on ADA paratransit service quality and performance in your area?

2. Vehicle operator recruitment and retention issues:

have not impacted our ADA paratransit service performance.

have had a minimal adverse impact on our ADA paratransit service performance.

have had a moderate adverse impact on our ADA paratransit service performance.

have had a significant adverse impact on our ADA paratransit service.

Not sure.

ADA Paratransit Service Performance, Statistics, and Cost

3. What was the reported on-time pick-up performance for your ADA paratransit service in the most recent reporting year?

4. How is the on-time window defined? (e.g., 15 min. before to 15 min after, 0 min. before to 30 min. after, etc.)

Please provide the following service statistics for your ADA paratransit service for the last full fiscal year. Please use National Transit Database (NTD) data definitions.

5. A. Total ADA paratransit ridership:

a1. ADA eligible rider trips for the most recent annual reporting period:

a2. PCA and companion trips for the most recent annual reporting period:

a3. Total annual ridership for the most recent annual reporting period (a1 + a2):

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

6. Other Operating Statistics

- B. Total annual vehicle-revenue-miles for the most recent reporting period:
- C. Total annual vehicle-revenue-hours for the most recent reporting period:
- D. Number of rider "no-shows" during the most recent annual reporting period:
- E. Number of service provider "missed trips" during the most recent annual reporting period:
- F. Number of preventable accidents during the most recent annual reporting period:
- G. Total ADA paratransit service annual operating costs for the most recent reporting period:

Direct Operation of Service

7. Do you operate any of your ADA paratransit service directly, with your own vehicle operators?

- No, we do not directly operate service **Skip to question 44**
- Yes, we directly operate some or all of our ADA paratransit service **Skip to question 11**

Type of Organization

8. Please indicate type of organization below.

- Private, for-profit company that serves as a contractor or subcontractor to provide ADA paratransit service.
- Private, non-profit company that serves as a contractor or subcontractor to provide ADA paratransit service.
- Other (please specify):

Contracting Agency

9. You indicated that your organization provides ADA paratransit service for a local public transit agency. Please identify the transit agency you provide services for:

Type of Contract

10. Does your company hire vehicle operators and operate services directly as part of the local ADA paratransit program?

- Yes, we hire vehicle operators and operate ADA paratransit services directly **Skip to question 49**
- No, we only provide other contract services for the public entity (e.g., only "broker" management services, or only call center services) **Skip to question 82**

Vehicle Operator Information

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

11. Please indicate below the number of full-time and part-time vehicle operators used to provide ADA paratransit service.

Number of full-time paratransit vehicle operators:

Number of part-time paratransit vehicle operators:

Total number of paratransit vehicle operators:

Clarification/ Notes:

12. Please provide the following ADA paratransit vehicle operator workforce turnover data for the most recent 12 month period:

a. Total number of vehicle operators employed (total no. from previous answer):

b. Number of vehicle operators who resigned voluntarily during the past 12-months (after training):

c. Number of vehicle operators who have been terminated during the past 12-months (after training):

d. Total number of vehicle operators who left employment (after training) during the past 12-months (calculated as b + c):

e. Annual turnover rate/percentage (calculated as d/a x 100):

13. In the past 12 months, how many ADA paratransit vehicle operator candidates were recruited and started training, and how many of those completed training?

a. Total number of vehicle operator candidates in the past 12 months that started training:

b. Total number of trainees that completed training in the past 12 months:

c. Training completion rate (calculated as b/a x 100):

14. If a high percentage of trainees (e.g., more than 33%) do not complete training, why do you think this is the case?

Paratransit Wage

15. Please indicate below the hourly wages for PARATRANSIT vehicle operators.

Training wage for paratransit vehicle operators:

Starting wage for paratransit vehicle operators:

Maximum wage for paratransit vehicle operators:

Unions

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

16. Are ADA paratransit vehicle operators represented by a labor union?

- No
- Yes, all
- Yes, some

Operation of Two Modes

17. Do you also employ fixed route vehicle operators who provide fixed route service?

- No **Skip to question 28**
- Yes

Fixed Route Wages

18. Please indicate below the hourly wages for FIXED ROUTE vehicle operators.

Training wage for fixed route vehicle operators:

Starting wage for fixed route vehicle operators:

Maximum wage for fixed route vehicle operators:

19. If the answers to the previous questions indicate significant differences in hourly pay between paratransit vehicle operators and fixed route vehicle operators, have you made any efforts to move toward more equal pay in order to ensure a more stable, experienced paratransit vehicle operator workforce?

- Yes, we have made changes toward equalizing pay between our paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators.
- No, we have not made any efforts to equalize pay between fixed route and paratransit vehicle operators. **Skip to question 21**
- Not applicable, there are not significant differences in pay rates between fixed route and ADA paratransit vehicle operators. **Skip to question 22**

Efforts Toward Equal Pay

20. With regard to moving toward equal pay for paratransit and fixed route drivers, please describe the efforts made and the qualitative or quantitative results:

Skip to question 22

Equal Pay

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

21. Why have you chosen to not move toward equalizing pay between fixed route and paratransit vehicle operators?

Operator Relationships

22. Which of the following statements best describes the relationship between ADA paratransit vehicle operators and fixed route vehicle operators ?

- Paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators are hired and managed separately. There is little crossover between the two groups.
- Vehicle operators are typically hired first for paratransit and then can move to fixed route if there is an opening. Movement between paratransit and fixed route HAS NOT created a significant turnover problem for paratransit, though.
- Vehicle operators are typically hired first for paratransit and then move to fixed route if there is an opening. Movement between paratransit and fixed route HAS created a significant turnover issue for paratransit.
- All vehicle operators are at the same pay scale and can work on either fixed route or paratransit.
- Not Sure.
- Other (describe):

Fringe Benefits- ADA and FR

23. Please indicate the number of paid vacation and paid holidays days per year provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year	Full-time fixed route vehicle operators- days/ year	Part-time fixed route vehicle operators- days/ year
Paid vacation (at start)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid vacation (max.)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid holidays	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

Other (please specify)

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

24. In the table below, please indicate the types of fringe benefits provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators. Check the appropriate box if the benefit is provided.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators	Full-time fixed route vehicle operators	Part-time fixed route vehicle operators
Individual health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Long-term disability coverage	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Paid sick leave	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Company contribution to retirement	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Other (please specify)/ Clarification/ Notes:

25. If a health care plan is provided, what is the typical employee contribution (as a percentage of the total premium) to health care coverage?

	Paratransit vehicle operators	Fixed route vehicle operators
Typical percent contribution for INDIVIDUAL health care coverage:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Typical percent contribution for FAMILY health care coverage:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

Split Shifts and Pay Differentials- ADA and FR Operators

26. What percentage of full-time and part-time vehicle operators work "split shifts" (e.g., morning and afternoon with an extended break in the mid-day)?

	Fixed route vehicle operators	Paratransit vehicle operators
Percentage of FULL-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Percentage of PART-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

27. Do you have pay differentials (e.g., higher pay rates) for fixed route or paratransit vehicle operators for any of the following?

	Fixed route vehicle operators	Paratransit vehicle operators
Vehicle operators who work split shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Vehicle operators who work part time shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Vehicle operators who work evenings or weekends:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

Other (please specify)

Skip to question 33

Fringe Benefits- ADA Operators

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

28. Please indicate the number of paid vacation and paid holidays days per year provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit vehicle operators.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year
Paid vacation (at start)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid vacation (max.)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid holidays	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Other (please specify)	<input type="text"/>	

29. In the table below, please indicate the types of fringe benefits provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit vehicle operators. Check the appropriate box if the benefit is provided.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators
Individual health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Long-term disability coverage	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Paid sick leave	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Company contribution to retirement	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other (please specify)/ Clarification/ Notes:	<input type="text"/>	

30. If a health care plan is provided, what is the typical employee contribution (as a percentage of the total premium) to health care coverage?

Typical percent contribution for INDIVIDUAL health care coverage:

Typical percent contribution for FAMILY health care coverage:

Split Shifts and Pay Differentials

31. What percentage of full-time and part-time vehicle operators work "split shifts" (e.g., morning and afternoon with an extended break in the mid-day)?

Percentage of FULL-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:

Percentage of PART-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

32. Do you have pay differentials (e.g., higher pay rates) for ADA paratransit vehicle operators for any of the following?

	Yes	No	Not Sure
Vehicle operators who work split shifts:	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Vehicle operators who work part time shifts:	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Vehicle operators who work evenings or weekends:	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Other (please specify)	<input type="text"/>		

Vehicle Operator Requirements

33. Please indicate below the types of pre-qualifications and background checks that are required for ADA paratransit vehicle operators in your system (check all that apply).

- Paratransit vehicle operators must meet a minimum age requirement.
- All paratransit vehicle operators must have a CDL license.
- Only those paratransit vehicle operators who drive larger vehicles must have a CDL license..
- A driving history check is performed and all paratransit vehicle operators must have a good driving record.
- A criminal background check is performed and paratransit vehicle operators must have a clean record.
- All paratransit vehicle operators must pass drug and alcohol screening tests.
- All paratransit vehicle operators must be proficient in English.
- Other (describe):

34. How many hours of classroom and on-the-road training are required for new ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

Classroom training hours:

On-the-road training hours:

Work Assignment

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

35. How is work assigned to ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

- Vehicle operators pick work shifts based on seniority.
- Vehicle operators are hired for a specific work shift and the shift does not vary.
- Vehicle operators are assigned work shifts by managers/schedulers as needed.
- Not sure.
- Vehicle operators pick work shifts on another basis (describe)/ Other:

Vehicle Operator Recruitment and Retention

36. Which of the following statements best describes your current situation in terms of your ADA paratransit vehicle operator workforce?

- There currently is a full complement of ADA paratransit vehicle operators and we have not experienced any significant vehicle operator recruitment or retention issues.
- We do not always have a full complement of ADA paratransit vehicle operators and vehicle operator recruitment and retention is somewhat of a problem.
- There is a constant shortage of ADA paratransit vehicle operators and we have experienced significant, ongoing problems with vehicle operator recruitment and retention.
- Not sure.
- Other/ Comments:

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

37. In your opinion, how much of an adverse impact does each of the following factors have on your efforts to RECRUIT ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

	No Impact	Little Impact	Some Impact	Moderate Impact	Significant Impact
Labor market/general shortage of workers	<input type="radio"/>				
Competition with other paratransit/transit services	<input type="radio"/>				
Pre-qualification requirements	<input type="radio"/>				
Drug testing	<input type="radio"/>				
Background checks	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of career advancement opportunities	<input type="radio"/>				
Vehicle type/size/design	<input type="radio"/>				
Job description/nature of the job	<input type="radio"/>				
Shift structure/hours available	<input type="radio"/>				
Wages offered	<input type="radio"/>				
Fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>				
Union issues	<input type="radio"/>				

Other (describe)/ Comments:

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

38. Please indicate if you have used any of the approaches listed below to improve ADA paratransit vehicle operator RECRUITMENT and, if so, the level of success with each approach.

	Not Used	Used with Little Success	Used with Some Success	Used with Good Success
Signing bonuses for recruits	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Referral bonus paid to other employees	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Paid training	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Targeted advertising	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Advertising in non-traditional ways	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Use of job fairs	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased hourly wages	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Extended shifts to increase total take home pay	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Provide performance/recognition awards/payments	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased career advancement opportunities	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
GPS or other technologies to assist with the job	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Provide uniforms	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

Other (describe)/ Comments:

39. If you indicated above that one or more approaches have been "Used With Good Success," please provide additional information on these "best practice" approaches.

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

40. In your opinion, how much of an adverse impact does each of the following factors have on your efforts to RETAIN ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

	No Impact	Little Impact	Some Impact	Moderate Impact	Significant Impact
Demands of the job	<input type="radio"/>				
Dissatisfaction with work shifts assigned	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of opportunities for advancement	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of recognition and performance incentives	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of support from dispatchers or supervisors	<input type="radio"/>				
Procedures for resolving driver issues/grievances	<input type="radio"/>				
Wages offered (find better paying jobs)	<input type="radio"/>				
Fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>				

Other (describe)/ Comments:

41. Please indicate if you have used any of the approaches listed below to improve ADA paratransit vehicle operator RETENTION and, if so, the level of success with each approach.

	Not Used	Used with Little Success	Used with Some Success	Used with Good Success
Targeted recruitment on particular applicant skills	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Performance bonuses	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Employee recognition programs	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Team-building efforts	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased opportunities for driver feedback	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved complaint investigation/mediation	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Keeping drivers updated on policies and procedures	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved dispatch support	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
GPS or other technologies to assist with the job	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved vehicle condition and/or work environment	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Modified/improved driver work shifts	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased training opportunities for operators/drivers	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Training in personnel management for managers	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased hourly wages	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Extended shifts to increase total take home pay	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Exit interviews with drivers who voluntarily leave	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

Other (describe)/ Comments:

42. If you indicated above that one or more approaches have been "Used With Good Success," please provide additional information on these "best practice" approaches.

43. If you have any written descriptions of programs and approaches that you feel have been particularly effective in improving ADA paratransit vehicle operator recruitment and/or retention, or any analysis that shows impacts on performance, please forward this information to the address listed at the end of this survey or let us know if we can contact you to get a copy.

- I will forward information to the address listed at the end of this survey.
- We have written information that may be helpful. Please contact me to get a copy.
- We do not have any written information on this topic to share.
- You can get a copy of the information on-line at:

Use of Contractors

44. Do you contract with private companies to operate all or some of your ADA paratransit service?

- No **Survey is complete for these respondents- directed to Thank You page**
- Yes

Contractors Used

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

45. Please list the companies that you contract with to provide all of some of your ADA paratransit service. Please also forward the survey link to them and ask that they complete the survey as well.

1.	<input type="text"/>
2.	<input type="text"/>
3.	<input type="text"/>
4.	<input type="text"/>
5.	<input type="text"/>
6.	<input type="text"/>
7.	<input type="text"/>
8.	<input type="text"/>
9.	<input type="text"/>
10.	<input type="text"/>
11.	<input type="text"/>

Procurement/ Contracting Approach

46. Please use the table below to indicate if you have used any of the listed procurement and contracting approaches to ensure that an adequate and stable vehicle operator workforce is provided. Also indicate the effectiveness of each approach used.

Procurement/ Contracting Approach:

	Not Used	Used; Little Impact	Used; Some Impact	Used; Moderate Impact	Used; Significant Impact
Included language in the RFP indicating that a stable, experienced vehicle operator workforce was expected	<input type="radio"/>				
Assigned points in the evaluation process on whether the proposal would provide a stable, experienced vehicle operator workforce	<input type="radio"/>				
Set a goal for maximum vehicle operator turnover	<input type="radio"/>				
Included "living wage" or other minimum wage standards in the RFP	<input type="radio"/>				
Included incentives and/or penalties in the contract related to maintaining an adequate vehicle operator workforce or covering all runs assigned	<input type="radio"/>				

Other (please specify)/ Additional Comments:

Contract Approaches with Some, Moderate, or Significant Impact

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

47. If you indicated in the previous question that one or more approaches have been used with "Some Impact," "Moderate Impact," or "Significant Impact," please provide additional information on these "best practice" approaches.

Written Descriptions of Contracting Approaches

48. If you have any written descriptions of the contracting approaches that you feel have been particularly effective in improving ADA paratransit vehicle operator recruitment and/or retention, please forward this information to the address listed at the end of this survey or let us know if we can contact you to get a copy.

- I will forward information to the address listed at the end of this survey.
- We have written information that may be helpful. Please contact me to get a copy.
- We do not have any written information on this topic to share.
- You can get a copy of the information on-line at:

Survey is complete for these respondents- directed to Thank You page

Vehicle Operator Information

49. Please indicate below the number of full-time and part-time vehicle operators used to provide ADA paratransit service.

Number of full-time paratransit vehicle operators:

Number of part-time paratransit vehicle operators:

Total number of paratransit vehicle operators:

Clarification/ Notes:

50. Please provide the following ADA paratransit vehicle operator workforce turnover data for the most recent 12 month period:

a. Total number of vehicle operators employed at the (total no. from previous answer):

b. Number of vehicle operators who resigned voluntarily during the past 12-months (after training):

c. Number of vehicle operators who have been terminated during the past 12-months (after training):

d. Total number of vehicle operators who left employment (after training) during the past 12-months (calculated as b + c):

e. Annual turnover rate/percentage (calculated as d/a x 100):

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

51. In the past 12 months, how many ADA paratransit vehicle operator candidates were recruited and started training, and how many of those completed training?

a. Total number of vehicle operator candidates in the past 12 months that started training:

b. Total number of trainees that completed training in the past 12 months:

c. Training completion rate (calculated as $b/a \times 100$):

52. If a high percentage of trainees (e.g., more than 33%) do not complete training, why do you think this is the case?

Paratransit Wage

53. Please indicate below the hourly wages for PARATRANSIT vehicle operators.

Training wage for paratransit vehicle operators:

Starting wage for paratransit vehicle operators:

Maximum wage for paratransit vehicle operators:

Unions

54. Are ADA paratransit vehicle operators represented by a labor union?

No

Yes, all

Yes, some

Operation of Two Modes

55. Do you operate fixed route services in the same area as your paratransit service?

No **Skip to question 66**

Yes

Fixed Route Wages

56. Please indicate below the hourly wages for FIXED ROUTE vehicle operators.

Training wage for fixed route vehicle operators:

Starting wage for fixed route vehicle operators:

Maximum wage for fixed route vehicle operators:

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

57. If the answers to the previous questions indicate significant differences in hourly pay between paratransit vehicle operators and fixed route vehicle operators, have you made any efforts to move toward more equal pay in order to ensure a more stable, experienced paratransit vehicle operator workforce?

- Yes, we have made changes toward equalizing pay between our paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators.
- No, we have not made any efforts to equalize pay between fixed route and paratransit vehicle operators. [Skip to question 59](#)
- Not applicable, there are not significant differences in pay rates between fixed route and ADA paratransit vehicle operators. [Skip to question 60](#)

Efforts Toward Equal Pay

58. With regard to moving toward equal pay for paratransit and fixed route drivers, please describe the efforts made and the qualitative or quantitative results:

[Skip to question 60](#)

Equal Pay

59. Why have you chosen to not move toward equalizing pay between fixed route and paratransit vehicle operators?

Operator Relationships

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

60. Which of the following statements best describes the relationship between ADA paratransit vehicle operators and fixed route vehicle operators ?

- Paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators are hired and managed separately. There is little crossover between the two groups.
- Vehicle operators are typically hired first for paratransit and then can move to fixed route if there is an opening. Movement between paratransit and fixed route HAS NOT created a significant turnover problem for paratransit, though.
- Vehicle operators are typically hired first for paratransit and then move to fixed route if there is an opening. Movement between paratransit and fixed route HAS created a significant turnover issue for paratransit.
- All vehicle operators are at the same pay scale and can work on either fixed route or paratransit.
- Not Sure.
- Other (describe):

Fringe Benefits- ADA and FR

61. Please indicate the number of paid vacation and paid holidays days per year provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year	Full-time fixed route vehicle operators- days/ year	Part-time fixed route vehicle operators- days/ year
Paid vacation (at start)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid vacation (max.)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid holidays	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

Other (please specify)

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

62. In the table below, please indicate the types of fringe benefits provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators. Check the appropriate box if the benefit is provided.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators	Full-time fixed route vehicle operators	Part-time fixed route vehicle operators
Individual health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Long-term disability coverage	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Paid sick leave	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Company contribution to retirement	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Other (please specify)/ Clarification/ Notes:

63. If a health care plan is provided, what is the typical employee contribution (as a percentage of the total premium) to health care coverage?

	Paratransit vehicle operators	Fixed route vehicle operators
Typical percent contribution for INDIVIDUAL health care coverage:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Typical percent contribution for FAMILY health care coverage:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

Split Shifts and Pay Differentials- ADA and FR Operators

64. What percentage of full-time and part-time vehicle operators work "split shifts" (e.g., morning and afternoon with an extended break in the mid-day)?

	Fixed route vehicle operators	Paratransit vehicle operators
Percentage of FULL-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Percentage of PART-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

65. Do you have pay differentials (e.g., higher pay rates) for fixed route or paratransit vehicle operators for any of the following?

	Fixed route vehicle operators	Paratransit vehicle operators
Vehicle operators who work split shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Vehicle operators who work part time shifts:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Vehicle operators who work evenings or weekends:	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

Other (please specify)

[Skip to question 71](#)

Fringe Benefits- ADA Operators

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

66. Please indicate the number of paid vacation and paid holidays days per year provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit vehicle operators.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators- days/ year
Paid vacation (at start)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid vacation (max.)	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Paid holidays	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Other (please specify)	<input type="text"/>	

67. In the table below, please indicate the types of fringe benefits provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit vehicle operators. Check the appropriate box if the benefit is provided.

	Full-time paratransit vehicle operators	Part-time paratransit vehicle operators
Individual health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family health care plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Long-term disability coverage	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Paid sick leave	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Company contribution to retirement	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other (please specify)/ Clarification/ Notes:	<input type="text"/>	

68. If a health care plan is provided, what is the typical employee contribution (as a percentage of the total premium) to health care coverage?

Typical percent contribution for INDIVIDUAL health care coverage:

Typical percent contribution for FAMILY health care coverage:

Split Shifts and Pay Differentials

69. What percentage of full-time and part-time vehicle operators work "split shifts" (e.g., morning and afternoon with an extended break in the mid-day)?

Percentage of FULL-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:

Percentage of PART-TIME vehicle operators working split shifts:

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

70. Do you have pay differentials (e.g., higher pay rates) for ADA paratransit vehicle operators for any of the following?

	Yes	No	Not Sure
Vehicle operators who work split shifts:	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Vehicle operators who work part time shifts:	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Vehicle operators who work evenings or weekends:	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Other (please specify)	<input type="text"/>		

Vehicle Operator Requirements

71. Please indicate below the types of pre-qualifications and background checks that are required for ADA paratransit vehicle operators in your system (check all that apply).

- Paratransit vehicle operators must meet a minimum age requirement.
- All paratransit vehicle operators must have a CDL license.
- Only those paratransit vehicle operators who drive larger vehicles must have a CDL license..
- A driving history check is performed and all paratransit vehicle operators must have a good driving record.
- A criminal background check is performed and paratransit vehicle operators must have a clean record.
- All paratransit vehicle operators must pass drug and alcohol screening tests.
- All paratransit vehicle operators must be proficient in English.
- Other (describe):

72. How many hours of classroom and on-the-road training are required for new ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

Classroom training hours:

On-the-road training hours:

Work Assignment

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

73. How is work assigned to ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

- Vehicle operators pick work shifts based on seniority.
- Vehicle operators are hired for a specific work shift and the shift does not vary.
- Vehicle operators are assigned work shifts by managers/schedulers as needed.
- Not sure.
- Vehicle operators pick work shifts on another basis (describe)/ Other:

Vehicle Operator Recruitment and Retention

74. Which of the following statements best describes your current situation in terms of your ADA paratransit vehicle operator workforce?

- There currently is a full complement of ADA paratransit vehicle operators and we have not experienced any significant vehicle operator recruitment or retention issues.
- We do not always have a full complement of ADA paratransit vehicle operators and vehicle operator recruitment and retention is somewhat of a problem.
- There is a constant shortage of ADA paratransit vehicle operators and we have experienced significant, ongoing problems with vehicle operator recruitment and retention.
- Not sure.
- Other/ Comments:

Survey is complete for these respondents- directed to Thank You page

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

75. In your opinion, how much of an adverse impact does each of the following factors have on your efforts to RECRUIT ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

	No Impact	Little Impact	Some Impact	Moderate Impact	Significant Impact
Labor market/general shortage of workers	<input type="radio"/>				
Competition with other paratransit/transit services	<input type="radio"/>				
Pre-qualification requirements	<input type="radio"/>				
Drug testing	<input type="radio"/>				
Background checks	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of career advancement opportunities	<input type="radio"/>				
Vehicle type/size/design	<input type="radio"/>				
Job description/nature of the job	<input type="radio"/>				
Shift structure/hours available	<input type="radio"/>				
Wages offered	<input type="radio"/>				
Fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>				
Union issues	<input type="radio"/>				

Other (describe)/ Comments:

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

76. Please indicate if you have used any of the approaches listed below to improve ADA paratransit vehicle operator RECRUITMENT and, if so, the level of success with each approach.

	Not Used	Used with Little Success	Used with Some Success	Used with Good Success
Signing bonuses for recruits	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Referral bonus paid to other employees	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Paid training	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Targeted advertising	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Advertising in non-traditional ways	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Use of job fairs	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased hourly wages	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Extended shifts to increase total take home pay	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Provide performance/recognition awards/payments	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased career advancement opportunities	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
GPS or other technologies to assist with the job	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Provide uniforms	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

Other (describe)/ Comments:

77. If you indicated above that one or more approaches have been "Used With Good Success," please provide additional information on these "best practice" approaches.

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

78. In your opinion, how much of an adverse impact does each of the following factors have on your efforts to RETAIN ADA paratransit vehicle operators?

	No Impact	Little Impact	Some Impact	Moderate Impact	Significant Impact
Demands of the job	<input type="radio"/>				
Dissatisfaction with work shifts assigned	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of opportunities for advancement	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of recognition and performance incentives	<input type="radio"/>				
Lack of support from dispatchers or supervisors	<input type="radio"/>				
Procedures for resolving driver issues/grievances	<input type="radio"/>				
Wages offered (find better paying jobs)	<input type="radio"/>				
Fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>				

Other (describe)/ Comments:

79. Please indicate if you have used any of the approaches listed below to improve ADA paratransit vehicle operator RETENTION and, if so, the level of success with each approach.

	Not Used	Used with Little Success	Used with Some Success	Used with Good Success
Targeted recruitment on particular applicant skills	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Performance bonuses	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Employee recognition programs	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Team-building efforts	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased opportunities for driver feedback	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved complaint investigation/mediation	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Keeping drivers updated on policies and procedures	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved dispatch support	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
GPS or other technologies to assist with the job	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved vehicle condition and/or work environment	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Modified/improved driver work shifts	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased training opportunities for operators/drivers	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Training in personnel management for managers	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Increased hourly wages	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Improved fringe benefits offered	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Extended shifts to increase total take home pay	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Exit interviews with drivers who voluntarily leave	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

Other (describe)/ Comments:

80. If you indicated above that one or more approaches have been "Used With Good Success," please provide additional information on these "best practice" approaches.

81. If you have any written descriptions of programs and approaches that you feel have been particularly effective in improving ADA paratransit vehicle operator recruitment and/or retention, or any analysis that shows impacts on performance, please forward this information to the address listed at the end of this survey or let us know if we can contact you to get a copy.

- I will forward information to the address listed at the end of this survey.
- We have written information that may be helpful. Please contact me to get a copy.
- We do not have any written information on this topic to share.
- You can get a copy of the information on-line at:

Impact of Recruitment and Retention

82. In your opinion, which of the following statements best describes the impact that vehicle operator recruitment and retention at other companies that do operate service directly has had on ADA paratransit service quality and performance in your area?

83. Vehicle operator recruitment and retention issues:

- have not impacted our ADA paratransit service performance.
- have had a minimal adverse impact on our ADA paratransit service performance.
- have had a moderate adverse impact on our ADA paratransit service performance.
- have had a significant adverse impact on our ADA paratransit service.
- Not sure.

TCRP Project F-13 Survey

THANK YOU

Please work with the local public transit agency to ensure that this survey also reaches companies that hire vehicle operators and directly operate ADA paratransit services.

THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME TO COMPLETE THIS SURVEY

THANK YOU

Thank you for taking the time to complete this survey.

Please forward any "best practice" materials from your agency or other information on this topic that you think would be useful in our research to:

Mr. Russell Thatcher, Senior Transportation Planner
TranSystems Corp.
One Cabot Road
Medford, MA 02155

rhthatcher@transystems.com

REMINDER: IF YOU ARE A PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCY THAT CONTRACTS OUT FOR SOME OR ALL OF YOUR ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICE, PLEASE REMEMBER TO SEND THE SURVEY LINK TO YOUR CONTRACTORS. The survey has a separate "contractor" section that requests different information from private contractors.

SURVEY IS COMPLETE

Thank you

APPENDIX B

Productivity by Tenure Group, DART, Dallas, TX

Run Type	< 3 Months		3-5 Months		6-12 Month		13-24 Months		25-60 Month		61+ Months		Totals	
	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity
Weekday AM Splits	26	1.65	19	1.77	31	1.98	33	1.66	83	1.9	74	1.76	266	1.8
Weekday AM Straights	29	1.66	30	1.73	16	1.66	34	1.72	33	1.71	315	1.74	457	1.73
Weekday Midday Splits	1	2.28	0	NA	2	1.57	3	1.87	4	1.64	0	NA	10	1.81
Weekday Midday Straights	1	1.18	2	1.73	2	1.45	0	NA	4	1.8	31	1.66	40	1.66
Weekday PM Splits	34	1.89	32	1.83	40	2.02	45	2	86	2.01	93	1.8	330	1.9
Weekday PM Straights	26	1.57	37	1.74	27	1.46	38	1.69	55	1.73	81	1.7	2.64	1.67
Weekday Evening	5	1	1	1.19	3	1.12	10	1.12	0	NA	6	1.65	25	1.18
Weekday "Protects"	3	0.98	3	1.46	8	1.24	8	1.01	9	1.1	14	1.12	45	1.12
Saturday AM Splits	3	1.38	3	1.48	3	1.32	0	NA	0	NA	1	1.34	10	1.34
Saturday AM Straights	6	1.47	6	1.44	5	1.46	5	1.4	3	1.16	8	1.36	33	1.4
Saturday Midday Splits	0	NA	1	1.22	1	1.79	0	NA	1	2.25	0	NA	3	1.7
Saturday Midday Straights	7	1.59	3	1.52	1	2.23	3	1.49	1	2.89	1	1.6	16	1.67
Saturday PM Splits	2	1.93	3	1.13	2	1.24	0	NA	1	2.13	1	1.86	9	1.52
Saturday PM Straights	1	1.76	0	NA	3	1.49	1	1.23	0	NA	1	2.3	6	1.64
Saturday Evening	3	1.07	6	1.66	1	1.46	2	1.27	0	NA	5	1.35	17	1.4
Saturday "Protects"	1	0.9	0	NA	2	1.28	0	NA	0	NA	1	0.84	4	1.03
Sunday AM Splits	4	1.54	1	1.36	0	NA	0	NA	1	1.58	0	NA	6	1.52
Sunday AM Straights	9	1.56	8	1.42	3	1.25	4	1.36	4	1.28	4	1.97	32	1.48
Sunday PM Splits	2	1.9	1	1.5	0	NA	0	NA	0	NA	1	1.03	4	1.58
Sunday PM Straights	3	1.57	8	1.37	0	NA	1	2.04	0	NA	2	0.96	14	1.36
Sunday "Protects"	1	1.06	0	NA	1	0.93	0	NA	1	1.01	3	1.46	6	1.28
Parkland Shuttle	1	1.32	0	NA	5	1.62	1	1.79	3	1.35	7	1.42	17	1.5

APPENDIX C

Productivity by Tenure Group, LYNX, Orlando, FL

Run Type	< 3 Months		3-5 Months		6-12 Month		13-24 Months		25-60 Month		61+ Months		Totals	
	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity	# Runs	Productivity
Weekday Low	1	0.79	0	NA	15	0.97	12	0.94	7	1.02	6	0.9	41	0.95
Weekday Medium-Low	0	NA	0	NA	11	1.12	15	1.23	4	1.11	0	NA	30	1.17
Weekday Medium	75	1.04	13	0.99	54	1.25	71	1.32	109	1.3	74	1.21	396	1.22
Weekday Medium-High	17	1.15	8	1.25	20	1.37	48	1.38	58	1.42	18	1.37	169	1.36
Weekday High	2	1.18	0	NA	11	1.5	27	1.57	14	1.31	8	1.73	62	1.51
Saturday	10	1.09	6	1.25	14	1.21	18	1.36	5	1.2	7	1.12	60	1.23
Sunday	6	0.99	2	1.11	9	1.05	6	1.04	3	1.35	2	1.16	28	1.07

APPENDIX D
Interview Protocol for Case Studies on Workforce
Integration and Wage Parity

Interview Protocol for Systems That Have Integrated Workforces/Achieved Wage Parity

Thank you very much for filling out the survey we sent you last year on driver recruitment and retention. We're now in the final stage of our research and are conducting a more detailed follow-up survey with a small sample of systems that have already, or are moving toward, integrating their paratransit and fixed route workforces or providing wage parity. I have all the information you gave us in the written survey, and will mainly be asking you follow-up questions on some of your responses.

First, I want to confirm that we have correct information regarding your workforce. Is it correct that:

- a) You are working towards equalizing pay for paratransit and fixed-route drivers

(check which apply and ask following questions accordingly)

1. Could you tell us something about how your system came to integrate its workforce/achieved equal pay for operators? Was it always that way? If not, when was the change implemented? Why did the system integrate the labor force and/or move towards pay equity?
2. Have you written anything that summarizes your experience with the change, including its benefits? Could we obtain a copy of that report?
3. When you implemented this change, did you also have to make changes to the way you operate the two systems? For example, did you bring paratransit in-house rather than contracting out the service?
4. Were there political, funding and budget issues that had to be addressed to make the change? How did you get support for these changes? Did you learn any lessons that you think may be useful to pass on to other transit agencies considering this change?
5. We already have information on the number of paratransit operators in your system. Can you tell the size of your fixed-route workforce?
6. You said in your survey response that your workforces are unionized. When you implemented these changes, were there union issues that had to be addressed?

Were both workforces represented by the same union before the integration? Did you learn any lessons on this issue you'd want to pass on to other systems?

7. We have current paratransit and fixed route wage and benefit information:

Hourly wages for paratransit vehicle operators			Hourly wages for fixed route vehicle operators		
Training	Starting	Max	Training	Starting	Max

Paid vacation and holidays days per year - full-time and part-time ADA paratransit and fixed route					
Paid vacation (at start) - Full-time paratransit vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid vacation (at start) - Part-time paratransit vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid vacation (at start) - Full-time fixed route vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid vacation (at start) - Part-time fixed route vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid vacation (max.) - Full-time paratransit vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid vacation (max.) - Part-time paratransit vehicle operators-days/ year

Paid vacation (max.) - Full-time fixed route vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid vacation (max.) - Part-time fixed route vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid holidays - Full-time paratransit vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid holidays - Part-time paratransit vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid holidays - Full-time fixed route vehicle operators-days/ year	Paid holidays - Part-time fixed route vehicle operators-days/ year

Types of fringe benefits provided to full-time and part-time ADA paratransit and fixed route vehicle operators					
Individual health care plan	Family health care plan	Long term disability coverage	Paid sick leave	Company contribution to retirement	Other (please specify)/ Clarification/ Notes:
Employee Contribution to Health Care Premium (percentage)					
Individual HC- PARA operators	Individual HC- FR operators	Family HC- PARA operators	Family HC- FR operators		

Is this information correct? We need to find out about wages and benefits from before you made the change. Can you tell us how, if at all, wages and fringe benefits were changed to achieve the integration/pay equity?

8. We calculated from your survey responses on operating budget and number of trips that your current paratransit cost per hour is approximately ____ (paratransit operating budget/vehicle revenue hours). Does that sound right to you? Do you know what it was before you made the change?
9. We calculated from your survey responses on operating budget and number of trips that your current paratransit cost per trip is approximately ____ (paratransit operating budget/number of trips). Does that sound right to you? Do you know what it was before you made the change?
10. Based on the information we have, your paratransit operator training completion rate last year was _____. Do you have that before change? If your workforces are integrated, how did this change affect your vehicle operator training (e.g., training hours, completion rate before and after the change)?
11. Did you change background check procedures or licensing requirements when you made the change? How?
12. We calculated, based on your survey response, that the turnover rate for your operators was ____ (i.e., based on ____ resignations and ____ terminations in your workforce of ____). Does this sound right to you? Do you have the rate for before the change?
13. With regard to run selection, are there operators who prefer a particular mode? Have they been able to get the work they prefer? How has this impacted job satisfaction?
14. We're interested in how the change may have impacted performance. Was there an improvement in productivity (trips/hour) after you made the change? Would you say that there is now a more stable, skilled workforce in each mode?
15. Were there any changes in your on-time performance or other service quality measures after you introduced the change?

If the system indicated they have a report on the change (acknowledge asking about report in question 2): Is this information summarized in your report on the change?

If the system does not have a report (as reflected in question 2): Would it be possible to obtain some basic statistical data that explains these performance improvements (e.g., on-time, turnover)?

16. If you did see improvements in productivity, have you analyzed whether these improvements made up for the increases in hourly operating costs? *Assuming hourly costs increased:* Even though your hourly costs went up, did you see improvements in productivity that made up for these cost? Do you have any analysis to show this?
17. Is there a combined extraboard pool? Do you think there are benefits in having a combined extraboard? Has run coverage improved? What type of extraboard did paratransit have prior to the change?
18. Since you consolidated workforces, do you think that operators are more familiar with the street network or with the needs of riders? Did you ever conduct a customer satisfaction survey?
19. If operators rotate between services, do you think this rotation has improved disability awareness in fixed route operations? What is the impact on riders, in both fixed route and paratransit service?
20. Has there been an increase in the use of fixed route service by riders with disabilities?
21. If your system has not always had wage parity or an integrated workforce, can you suggest member(s) of the disability community who we might contact and ask about the change?
22. If your system has not always had wage parity or an integrated workforce, can you suggest union leader(s) who we might contact and ask about the change?
23. Do you have any other thoughts about how your implementation of workforce integration/wage parity has affected the delivery of your services?